Appl. No.: 10/568,699

Atty. Docket No.: 2003M091 Office Action dated May 20, 2009

Date: August 18, 2009

## **SUPPORT FOR THE AMENDMENTS**

Claim 10 has been amended to include the limitations of original Claim 29 and delete the "optional" language with respect to use of filter aid. Certain other claims have been cancelled in order to be consistent with the amendments to Claim 10 and/or to reduce the issues, without prejudice to the subject matter therein.

It is believed there is no possibility of new matter and entry and consideration of the amended claims is respectfully requested.

Appl. No.: 10/568,699 Atty. Docket No.: 2003M091 Office Action dated May 20, 2009

Date: August 18, 2009

**REMARKS** 

Claims 10-12, 19, 23, and 26-28 are in the case.

The claims were previously rejected over Godwin et al. (US 4,543,420) in view of Schlosberg et al. (US 5,798,319). This rejection is respectfully traversed.

Godwin et al. is directed to pyromellitate plasticizers. In contrast, the present claims are directed to production of phthalate plasticizers.

It is alleged that Schlosberg et al. is "analogous" art. Perhaps for some things, but for purification to as to yield improved liquid volume resistivity? This improved liquid volume resistivity is now part of the claims. There is no evidence of record on this point of analogy, nor on the carbonyl number or light ends content also claimed.

Any combination of Godwin et al. and Schlosberg et al. to can arrive at the present invention only by picking and choosing from the references. No rationale has been advanced as to why such picking and choosing is done. In addition, no reason was given as to why the parameters of former Claim 29, now part of principal Claim 10, were obvious in view of the combination. Applicant's request that any new rejection address these limitations.

For these reasons, it is believed that the present claims are in conditions for allowance and early notice to this effect is earnestly solicited.

August 18, 2009

Date

Andrew B. Griffis

Andrew B. Griffis

Andrew B. Griffis

Attorney for Applicants

Registration No. 36,336

Post Office Address (to which correspondence is to be sent): ExxonMobil Chemical Company
Law Technology Department
P.O. Box 2149
Baytown, Texas 77522-2149

Phone: (281) 834-1886 Fax: (281) 834-2495